IEEE-SA Standards Board Audit Committee (AudCom) Minutes

28 August 2012
9:00 am – 12:00 pm
Piscataway, NJ USA

Members:
Peter Balma
Clint Chaplin
Michael Janezic
Bruce Kraemer
Hung Ling
Ted Olsen, Chair
Ron Petersen
Gary Robinson
Mike Seavey
Yatin Trivedi

Members Absent:
Paul Houzé
Rob Oshana
Howard Wolfman

Guests:
Chuck Adams
Karen Bartleson
Bill Bartley
Dennis Brophy
Ted Burse
Paul Eastman
Jean-Philippe Faure
Robert Fish
Alex Gelman
Bob Grow
Jim Hughes
Rich Hulett
John Kulick
David Law
Kevin Lu
Bill Moncrief
Glenn Parsons
Jon Rosdahl
Mel Sanders

Curtis Siller
Jerry Thrasher
Claire Topp
Don Wright

Staff:
Bill Ash
Kathryn Bennett
Christina Boyce
Matt Ceglia
Sri Chandra
Terry deCourcelle
Karen Evangelista
Tricia Gerdon
Krista Gluchoski
Mary Ellen Hanntz
Noelle Humenick
Konstantinos Karachalios
Mike Kipness
Gregory Marchini
Mary Lynne Nielsen
Moira Patterson
Lisa Perry
Walter Pienciak
Edward Rashba
Dave Ringle
Ana Sainvilus
Erin Spiewak
Theresa Steenweg
Jing Sun
Cherry Tom
Michelle Turner
Sue Vogel
Joan Woolery
Lisa Yacone, Administrator
Malia Zaman

[Unless otherwise noted, all votes are unanimous]

1. CALL TO ORDER
Chair Olsen called the meeting to order at 9:07 am. Introductions were made around the room.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA
A motion was made, and seconded, to approve the agenda. Upon vote, the motion passed.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE 06 JUNE 2012 AUDCOM MEETING
A motion was made, and seconded, to approve the minutes of the 06 June 2012. Upon vote, the minutes were approved.

4. P&P REVIEW

4.1 Status of Continuing Sponsor P&P Review

4.1.1 C/FIPA - Hung Ling, H Wolfman
Hung reported that he and Howard are still waiting, since March, for a revised set of P&P from the Sponsor. Joan Woolery, the staff liaison for C/FIPA, provided a detailed history/explanation of C/FIPA. They have been developing standards under a non IEEE process and then submitting the standards to become IEEE standards. Joan reported she had informed the group that if they are developing standards intended for the IEEE, the process begins with a PAR. Legal counsel noted that, as the group was identifying themselves as IEEE FIPA, they need to operate using our P&P otherwise they will not be indemnified. The accepted P&P which C/FIPA is supposed to have been operating under expired in 2009 and has had two extensions.

The following motion was made:
We advise C/FIPA that standards development work in accordance with the previously approved P&P is authorized through the end of the year. New P&P must be accepted by the end of the year or standards activity will no longer be authorized.
After a long discussion Gary Robinson called the question.
The motion failed [Approve = 5, Opposed =5]

No action was taken. The revised P&P document will continue under review. The majority expressed that the current operation of C/FIPA be discussed at the Standards Board level.

4.2 New Sponsor P&P Review

4.2.1 C/LM – Paul Houzé, Gary Robinson

Gary reported that he and Paul had created a checklist which had been uploaded just last week. Gary and Paul did not have any significant concerns with the submitted P&P which had a few updates from the P&P AudCom accepted last year. The comments submitted point to areas where the document does not go along with the 2010 baseline. Discussion arose regarding the relatively unique C/LM P&P situation. C/LM submits an updated P&P every year. Should C/LM have to update to the current baseline each year? AudCom did not issue a decision on the question at the meeting. Discussion will continue if C/LM has any issues with the requested updates.

The C/LM P&P is not due to expire until December 2016. The current submittal will continue under review.

4.2.2 C/SI – Michael Janezic, Mike Seavey
Mike Seavey reported that this review has been halted. The submitted P&P document does not follow the baseline. When the current C/SI P&P was accepted in 2010, the Sponsor was told the next revision needed to conform to the IEEE-SASB approved baseline. Lisa is in dialog with the new Sponsor Chair for C/SI and will work with her to correct the issue.

The C/SI P&P is not due to expire until December 2015.

4.2.3 IAS/PCI – Howard Wolfman, Gary Robinson
Gary reported that he had finished his review and had recently received an email from Howard with his comments. The comments have not yet been sent to the Sponsor. There was concern about two elements in the submitted document: working group material which either should not be there or is improperly called a working group instead of a subcommittee and material having to do with interaction with SCC18.

AI: Ted, Lisa, Rich Hulett, Sue Vogel and Lisa Perry will follow up to provide clear review and instruction to IAS/PCI before their meetings in September.

4.2.4 PE/SB – Bruce Kraemer, Yatin Trivedi
Bruce and Yatin reported that they had submitted their comments to the Sponsor. The Sponsor had responded and revised the document. Bruce and Yatin were satisfied with the revised P&P.

Motion: To accept the PE/SB P&P. Upon vote the motion passed.

4.2.5 PE/SUB – Hung Ling, Clint Chaplin
Hung has completed his initial review and is waiting on Clint's review before uploading the checklist into myProject.

AI: Clint will complete his review as soon as possible and send his comments to Hung so that the initial checklist can be uploaded for the Sponsor to review.

4.3 – Request to allow IM/MPS TC39, established as a sponsor under the Instrumentation and Measurement Society to operate under IM approved P&P

Motion: AudCom recommends acceptance of the establishment of an additional Sponsor – Instrumentation and Measurement/Measurements in Power Systems TC39 (IM/MPS TC39) operating under the currently approved Instrumentation and Measurement Society Policies and Procedures which were accepted by the IEEE-SASB on 25 March 2010. Upon vote, the motion was approved.

4.4 Working Group P&P Review

4.4.1 C/EASC – Paul Houzé, Ted Olsen
Ted reported that due to ongoing discussion without resolution, he had asked all of AudCom to review the WG P&P and checklist attached to the agenda. AudCom and C/EASC have been at an impasse regarding issues of openness (AudCom's main concern) versus balance (C/EASC's main concern) in the WG P&P. Paul Eastman of the Computer Society/Standards Activity Board, explained the reasons behind C/EASC's desire for balance. Gary Robinson, who had also performed a review of the submitted WG P&P, stated his strong opposition to the text contained in Clause 7.2 which goes against the principles of openness required in the IEEE-SA and ANSI.

No action was taken. The C/EASC WG P&P will continue under review.

AI: Lisa will add Gary's concerns to the recent updated checklist submitted by Paul and Ted.

4.4.2 C/MSC – Ron Petersen, Rob Oshana
AudCom will report to the IEEE-SA Standards Board that no issues have been found with the C/MSC WG P&P. Contingent on item d) "Approval of minutes" being added back into the list contained in clause 9.2, Actions requiring approval by a majority.

4.4.3 COM/PLC –Yatin Trivedi, Bruce Kraemer
Yatin and Bruce reported that they sent a checklist to the Sponsor and are awaiting a response.

No action was taken. The COM/PLC WG P&P will continue under review.

4.4.4 IES/IES – Clint Chaplin, Ron Petersen
Ron has completed his review. As soon as Clint finishes his review, a checklist will be sent to the Sponsor.

No action was taken. The IES WG P&P will continue under review.

AI: Clint will add his comments to Ron's and then will forward them to Lisa so that they can be sent to the Sponsor as soon as possible.

4.4.5 C/IA - Peter Balma, Michael Janezic - The comment checklist was sent to the sponsor this past week. The Sponsor will respond shortly.

No action was taken. The C/IA WG P&P will continue under review.

5. OLD BUSINESS

5.1 Annual updates to baseline documents - Information - Ted Olsen
Ted happily reported that the five baseline documents for sponsor and working group policies and procedures were approved by the IEEE-SASB on 21 August 2012. Ted thanked Peter Balma for all of the time and effort he put into editing the baselines. Ted also reported he had revised the associated checklists for each document and sent them to Lisa for review. Ted asked Lisa to work on establishing one spot (possibly Central Desktop) for AudCom members to access all of the superseded and current baselines and blank checklists.

Ted also mentioned that Lisa is keeping a "parking lot" list of issues that will be addressed at the next revision in 2014.

AI: Lisa will post the updates on the AudCom website and send notification to all Sponsor and Working Group Chairs. Lisa will also follow up on Ted's request for a central location for baselines and blank checklists and let the committee know when and where they are available.

5.2 Ad hoc for Electronic Business - Information - Mike Seavey
Mike gave a brief verbal update, reporting that wording proposed by the ad hoc had been incorporated into the newly accepted Sponsor P&P and that work is on track for presentation of a potential 'Guide' for Electronic Business at the December AudCom meeting.

6. NEW BUSINESS

6.1 myProject Update – Comment Tool - Lisa Yacone
Lisa showed the AudCom members a new feature of the AudCom agenda – the ability to add a comment to a P&P review. Sponsors and AudCom members will be notified in myProject of any submitted comments. This feature should be used in conjunction with and as follow up dialog to the review checklists.

7. DATE OF NEXT MEETING
The next meeting of AudCom is scheduled for 03 December 2012 in Piscataway, NJ, USA.

8. ADJOURNMENT
There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:10 pm.