

AudCom Minutes

September-October 2015

IEEE-SA Standards Board Audit Committee (AudCom) Meeting Minutes

21 September 2015 9:00 a.m. -11:00 a.m. ET Webex Teleconference

Members:

Jean-Philippe Faure, Chair James Gilb Gary Hoffman Mike Janezic Ron Petersen Annette Reilly Gary Robinson Adrian Stephens Howard Wolfman

Members Absent:

Ted Olsen Glenn Parsons

IEEE Staff:

Melissa Aranzamendez
Christy Bahn
Karen Evangelista
Tricia Gerdon
Jonathan Goldberg
Yvette Ho Sang
Soo Kim
Dave Ringle
Lisa Weisser, Administrator
Malia Zaman

1. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

Chair Faure called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and there was a round of introductions by all present.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Chair Faure asked if there were any additions, deletions, or alterations to the agenda.

Motion: Approve the 21 September 2015 AudCom teleconference meeting agenda. Upon vote, the motion passed.

3. REVIEW OF COMMENTS RECEIVED ON DRAFT D2 OF 2015 BASELINE UPDATES

This discussion continued the review of all comments about the Baseline Draft D2 documents that were not discussed at the AudCom meeting in Tokyo. Please see the spreadsheet below, which lists the comments received and their resolutions. Upcoming teleconferences picked up the discussion on the spreadsheet topic where the prior teleconference ended. Please also see the Minutes P&P Changes

IEEE Standards Association | 445 Hoes Lane | Piscataway NJ 08854 USA Phone: +1 732 981 0060 | Fax: +1 732 562 1571 | standards.ieee.org

document, which was approved at the meeting and details the disposition about changes to the Minutes clauses in the Baselines.

4. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business.

5. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next AudCom teleconference is scheduled for 28 September 2015 at 9:00 a.m. ET.

6. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

IEEE-SA Standards Board Audit Committee (AudCom) Unapproved Minutes

28 September 2015 9:00 a.m. - 11:00 a.m. ET Webex Teleconference

Members:

Jean-Philippe Faure, Chair James Gilb Mike Janezic Ted Olsen Ron Petersen Gary Robinson Adrian Stephens

Members Absent:

Gary Hoffman Glenn Parsons Annette Reilly Howard Wolfman

IEEE Staff:

Melissa Aranzamendez Karen Evangelista Jonathan Goldberg Yvette Ho Sang Mike Kipness Dave Ringle Pat Roder Erin Spiewak Lisa Weisser, Administrator

1. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

Chair Faure called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and there was a round of introductions by all present.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Chair Faure asked if there were any additions, deletions, or alterations to the published agenda.

AudCom Minutes July 2015

Motion: Approve the 28 September 2015 AudCom teleconference meeting agenda. Upon vote, the motion passed.

3. REVIEW OF COMMENTS RECEIVED ON DRAFT D2 OF 2015 BASELINE UPDATES

The discussion continued the review of all comments about the Baseline Draft D2 documents. All of the spreadsheet comments were discussed with the exception of those comments deferred from Draft D1. Please see the spreadsheet below, which lists the comments received and their resolutions. Upcoming teleconferences will pick up the discussion about the deferred comments, and any new comments.

During the meeting, it was agreed that there will be a brief editorial review of the Baselines by AudCom before they are sent for ballot.

There was an initial discussion on the inputs from the Ad Hoc on Referencing unaudited Sponsor documents (e.g. Sponsor Operating Manuals, etc.) in P&Ps chaired by Adrian Stephens. The discussion will continue at the next teleconference.

4. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business.

5. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next AudCom teleconference is scheduled for 5 October 2015 at 9:00 a.m. ET.

6. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 1:00 p.m.

IEEE-SA Standards Board Audit Committee (AudCom) Unapproved Minutes

5 October 2015 9:00 a.m. - 11:00 a.m. ET Webex Teleconference

Members:

Jean-Philippe Faure, Chair James Gilb Gary Hoffman Ted Olsen Ron Petersen Annette Reilly Gary Robinson Adrian Stephens Howard Wolfman

Members Absent:Michael Janezic
Glenn Parsons

AudCom Minutes July 2015

IEEE Staff:

Melissa Aranzamendez Karen Evangelista Tricia Gerdon Jonathan Goldberg Soo Kim Brenda Mancuso Lisa Weisser, Administrator Malia Zaman

1. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS

Chair Faure called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and there was a round of introductions by all present.

2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Chair Faure asked if there were any additions, deletions, or alterations to the published agenda.

Motion: Approve the 5 October 2015 AudCom meeting agenda. Upon vote, the motion passed.

3. 2015 Baselines

All remaining open items related to the 2015 Baseline updates were covered during this call. There were additional comments brought up by James Gilb. At this time, the comments on Draft D1 deferred to the September meeting were also reviewed. Please see the spreadsheet below, which lists the comments received and their resolutions.

The discussion was continued from the last call about the inputs from the Ad Hoc on Referencing unaudited Sponsor documents (e.g. Sponsor Operating Manuals, etc.) in P&Ps. It was agreed the topic will continue into 2016 and move to the next Baseline update and not be resolved at this time.

Gary Hoffman opened a discussion on the Baseline Instructions and whether these should be separate documents from the Baseline documents.

There was a discussion about next steps for timing to get Standards Board approval of the Baselines.

Please see the document D2 Resolutions Progress Report for all motions and decisions made during all three teleconferences.

4. NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business.

5. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

AudCom Minutes July 2015

The next AudCom meeting is 3 December in Piscataway, New Jersey, USA.

6. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	I	J	К	L	М
1		AudCom	D2 base	lines	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2													
3					Ва	aseli	ne						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
5	1	Reilly	1			x				The following instruction appears in the SCC1 template but not in the SCC2 template.	Add: This instructional front matter is intended to aid in the drafting of policies and procedures documents. If a discrepancy is found between the instructional front matter and the red text instructions within the baseline policies and procedures, the red text instructions within the baseline take precedence.	Accept	9/1/2015
	2	Reilly	2		х				11	11 1.0.3 and 1.0.4 are misnumbered a		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
6										1.03 and 1.04, also in line 134.			
7	3	Reilly	3			х			84-85	1.0.3 is misnumbered as 1.03 and there are two commas after 2.1. In line 140, 1.0.4 is misnumbered as 1.04.	correct numbering and punctuation.	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
8	4	Reilly	4		х				111	says the remainder of the clause shall not be modified, however, the is a gray shaded "committee" in line 1146 that has to be modified with the name of the committee.		Accept + remove italics	9/1/2015
9	5	Reilly	5			х			123	says the remainder of the clause shall not be modified, however, the is a gray shaded "committee" in line 1264 that has to be modified with the name of the committee.		Accept + remove italics	9/1/2015
10	6	Reilly	6			х			13	34 incorrect reference as other subgroups is section 5.5	change 5.2 to 5.5.	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
11		Reilly	7		х				16	69 instructions shall use "shall"	change 'has to' to 'shall'	Accept	9/1/2015
12	8	Reilly	8		х					This clause 4.1 has numbered subsections with lettered sub-sub sections. All other clauses have lettered subsections	Use lettered sections with numbered subsections as needed in 4.1.a.1 to 3.	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
13	9	Reilly	9		Х				18	86 missing comma after yes,	correct punctuation	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
14		Reilly	10			х				53 missing comma after yes,	correct punctuation	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015

	А	В	С	D	Е		G		ļ		J	K	L	М
1		AudCom [D2 base	line	s coi	mpila	ation	of c	omments					
2						L.,								
3					В	aseli	_							
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no		Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
15	11	Reilly	11		х				20	1	verb inconsistency, will or would. Also, .pdf of any P&P in any font can be zoomed by the user to improve legibility.	Authors of P&P documents should select a font that can be made legible when read on a digital device.	Change the last sentence of the paragraph with "Authors of P&P documents should select a font that is legible when read on a digital device."	9/1/2015
16	12	Reilly	12	х					20	1	verb inconsistency, will or would. Also, .pdf of any P&P in any font can be zoomed by the user to improve legibility.	Authors of P&P documents should select a font that can be made legible when read on a digital device.	Change the last sentence of the paragraph with "Authors of P&P documents should select a font that is legible when read on a digital device."	9/1/2015
17	13	Reilly	13		х				38	_	Text in red is not instructions and should be part of the P&P	change to black: If the scope of this Committee changes, the rules in the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual concerning change of scope shall be followed.	Accept	9/1/2015
18	14	Reilly	14			х			18	1	verb inconsistency, will or would. Also, .pdf of any P&P in any font can be zoomed by the user to improve legibility.	Authors of P&P documents should select a font that can be made legible when read on a digital device.	Change the last sentence of the paragraph with "Authors of P&P documents should select a font that is legible when read on a digital device."	9/1/2015
19	15	Reilly	15				x		19	1	singular-plural inconsistency: a computer screens. Also, a.pdf of any P&P in any font can be zoomed by the user to improve legibility.	be made legible when read on a digital device.	Change the last sentence of the paragraph with "Authors of P&P documents should select a font that is legible when read on a digital device."	9/1/2015
20	16	Reilly	16					х			verb inconsistency, will or would. Also, .pdf of any P&P in any font can be zoomed by the user to improve legibility.	Authors of P&P documents should select a font that can be made legible when read on a digital device.	Change the last sentence of the paragraph with "Authors of P&P documents should select a font that is legible when read on a digital device."	9/1/2015
21	17	Reilly	17		Х				42	21	two periods at end of sentence	correct punctuation	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015

	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	I		J	K	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	lines	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments			,		
2						L.,								
3					В	aseli	_			_				
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no		Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
22	18	Reilly	18		х				4		A responsibility with respect to the membership roster has been omitted.	Insert: Limiting distribution of the membership roster to appropriate parties. Or if there are no limitations on distribution of the membership roster, then clause 4.3 needs to be revised or removed.	Insert: Limiting distribution of the membership roster to appropriate parties.	9/1/2015
23	19	Reilly	19		x				4		Says a person may hold the offices of Secretary and another office other than chair. Other P&P make a similar statement about Treasurer. Why is this inconsistent?	A person may simultaneously hold the positions of Treasurer and another office, other than Chair.	Change to "A person may simultaneously hold the positions of Treasurer and another office, other than Chair."	9/1/2015
24	20	Reilly	20			х			4		This has SB Bylaws references by clause number instead of title.	change to IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws clause on "participation in IEEE Standards Development"	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
25	21	Reilly	21		х				5		This clause 3.4 has lettered subsections with lettered sub-sub sections. All other clauses have lettered subsections with numbered sub-subsections.		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
26	22	Reilly	22		х				7	'16	inconsistent capitalization	executive committees (ExCom) and administrative committees (AdCom)	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
27	23	Reilly	23			х					inconsistent capitalization	executive committees (ExCom) and administrative committees (AdCom)	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
28	24	Reilly	24			Х					missing closing quotation mark	to initiate the project."	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
29	25	Reilly	25		х				7		A Type 1 SCC does not develop standards or contribute to their progress.	remove 'progressing draft standards,'	Reject	9/1/2015

	Α	В	С	D	Ε	F	G	Н	I	J	K	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	lines	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2													
3					Ва	aseli	_						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
30		Reilly		X						Incorrect use of must rather than shall. Also, is the Sponsor mandated to approve moving every draft standard to sponsor ballot? This appears to contradict 7.1.1.d	approval by the Sponsor or a delegated subgroup to move to Sponsor ballot. When approval authority is delegated to a subgroup, the Sponsor oversight shall be limited to conducting a procedural review.	Change the three first sentences to "Moving a draft standards to Sponsor ballot requires approval of the Sponsor. Approval by the Sponsor shall be limited to conducting a procedural review. The Sponsor may delegate this approval authority to a subgroup."	9/1/2015
31	27	Reilly	27			х				Incorrect use of must rather than shall. Also, is the Type 2 committee mandated to approve moving every draft standard to sponsor ballot? This appears to contradict 7.1.1.d	Draft standards shall require technical review and approval by the Committee or a delegated subgroup to move to Sponsor ballot. When approval authority is delegated to a subgroup, the Committee's oversight shall be limited to conducting a procedural review.	Change the three first sentences to "Moving a draft standards to Sponsor ballot requires approval of the Committee Approval by the Committee shall be limited to conducting a procedural review. The Committee may delegate this approval authority to a subgroup."	9/1/2015
32	28	Reilly	28			х				"Sponsor balloting" is ambiguous. Does this mean the Type 2 SCC has to give authorization every time the Sponsor conducts a ballot on any matter? It sounds as though the SCC is duplicating the work of the Sponsor.	d) acting as Sponsor for developing standards, including authorization for submittal of a PAR, modification of a PAR, withdrawal of a PAR, and conducting balloting on a draft standard.	Change "Sponsor balloting" to "Moving a draft standard to Sponsor Ballot"	9/1/2015
33	29	Reilly	29	Х					95	misnumbered section reference, also in line 103 and line 171	change 1.04 to 1.0.4 and 1.03 to 1.0.3	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015

	А	В	С	D		F		Н	I		J	K	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	elines	s coi	mpila	ation	of c	omments					
2														
3					В	aseli	ne							
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no		Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
	30	Reilly	30	х					1:		This statement about what constitutes "written communication" applies to section 9, Appeals, and should be part of the template P&P and not part of the instructions. Instructions on how communications are handled during review of the P&P are provided elsewhere in the MyProject system and its messages.	Move to clause 9, e.g., follow line 1239: "Written communication" includes but is not limited to meeting minutes, letter, email, and fax.	Create a definition clause and include "Written communication" includes but is not limited to meeting minutes, letter, email, and fax."	9/1/2015
34														- 1 - 1
35		Reilly		Х							Reference should be more specific	change 4.4 to 4.4.d	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
36		Reilly	32				Х				Reference should be more specific, also in line 186	change 4.3 to 4.3.c and 4.4 in line 186 to 4.4.c.	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
37	33	Reilly	33	Х					7:	30	deprecated spelling has been used	change publically to publicly	Accept	9/1/2015
38	34	Reilly	34			Х			68	82	deprecated spelling has been used	change publically to publicly	Accept	9/1/2015
39	35	Reilly	35		х				70	02	deprecated spelling has been used	change publically to publicly	Accept	9/1/2015
40	36	Reilly	36				х		7:	31	deprecated spelling has been used	change publically to publicly	Accept (check the Entity baseline)	9/1/2015
41	37	Reilly	37	x					4		Case 1: "the entity that established the sponsor" can be misinterpreted as referring to a group outside IEEE which is conducting its standards development by agreement with the IEEE SA. This has the unfortunate effect of referring to external procedures that are not traceable through the section 1.0.3 hierarchy. Also, even if the entity that established the sponsor is an IEEE society, again there is a reference to procedures that are not traceable through the section 1.0.3 hierarchy and may contradict this template.	Do not use phrase "in accordance with the procedures of the entity that established the sponsor." Define the procedure here in 3.1. State specifically who appoints the Chair.	Remove the first sentence. Change the second sentence to "The Sponsor Chair shall be appointed by the entity that oversees the Sponsor". Change other instances of "entity that established the sponsor" to "entity that oversees the sponsor". Update case 2 to match.	9/1/2015

	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	I		J	K	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	line	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments					
2														
3					В	aselii								
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Ó	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
42	38	Reilly	38			х			59	96 i	·	Change text color from black to red.	Accept	9/1/2015
43	39	Reilly	39	х					7:	95	Section titles are initial capital letters	Change to PAR Development	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
44	40	Reilly	40	Х					88		Either' is used with two alternatives, but here there are three choices	Delete 'either'	Accept	9/1/2015
45	41	Reilly	41			х			83		Either' is used with two alternatives, but here there are three choices	Delete 'either'	Accept	9/1/2015
46	42	Reilly	42		х				7-		Either' is used with two alternatives, out here there are three choices	Delete 'either'	Accept	9/1/2015
47	43	Reilly	43	х					90	01 r	run-on sentence	change to and wishes to attend. However, some meetings	Accept	9/1/2015
48	44	Reilly	44				х				The same instruction is duplicated at ine 100		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
49	45	Reilly	45				х		29	f i	An instruction (in red) needs to follow 1.0 to alert WG to avoid inserting text here where not permitted.	No text shall be inserted following this heading.	Accept (instruction from other P&Ps) + same change in the Entity baseline	9/1/2015
50	46	Reilly	46				x		3	88 <mark>2</mark>	2.0.b is not applicable to projects prepared under, or adopted from, the dual logo agreement with IEC or the Partner Standards Development Organization agreement with ISO/IEC JTC 1, which are customarily prepared in the templates of those organizations.	b) Use the IEEE Standards document template format [or the applicable template for standards jointly developed with, or adopted from, another international standards organization].	Accept + same change in the Entity baseline	9/1/2015
51	47	Reilly	47				Х		3	92 8	a responsibility has been omitted.	Add: f) Handling appeals as described in Clause 9.	Reject	9/1/2015
52	48	Reilly	48	Х					4	f	Additional instructions are needed for the title of section 3.1, depending on which case is chosen.	Add: If Case 1 is selected, change title to "Appointment of Officers". If case 3 is selected, change title to "Election of Officers".	Accept	9/1/2015

	А	В	С	D			G		I	J	K	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	lines	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2													
3					Ва	aseli	_						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
53	49	Reilly	49				x			"the sponsor that established this Working Group" is in italics, but not shaded. Is it supposed to be replaced? Also, many longtime working groups move from one sponsor to another (e.g., sponsored by an SCC or other board initially and then by a new sponsor). The sponsor that established this WG may no longer be appropriate for removing officers or taking any other action.	change to "in accordance with the procedures of the Sponsor of the Working Group."	Change "the Sponsor that established thie Working Group" to "the Sponsor" and removes italics	9/1/2015
54	50	Reilly	50				х		545	lack of parallel structure in h) Setting goals and deadlines and adhere to them.	change to h) Setting goals and deadlines and adhering to them.	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
55	51	Reilly	51	x					676	Headings use initial capitals	change to 4.1 Voting Membership Requirements	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
56	52	Reilly	52				х		745	misspelled word	change to Voting membership	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
57	53	Reilly	53				х			6.2 Conduct: In the Sponsor procedures, this same clause shall not be modified. So how could it be modified in the WG Procedures to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures?	Change to: This clause shall not be modified.	Accept	9/1/2015
58	54	Reilly	54					Х		superfluous period after Sponsor".)	correct punctuation	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
59		Reilly	55					х	361	Spell out acronyms on first use here, then use acronyms in section 4.1.	Each Designated Representative (DR) or Designated Representative Alternate (DRA) can make or second motions	For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
60	56	Reilly	56					х	398	Partial overlap between this sentence and the next (line 401). This sentence says that officers shall be DRs, but the next says they shall be representatives (meaning that officers could be DRA's and not DR's).	Change to: All officers shall be DR's or DRA's of entities that are IEEE-SA Advanced Entity Members.	Delete sentence on line 401 "Officers shall be representative"	9/1/2015

	A	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	I	J	К	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	lines	s coi	mpila	ation	of c	omments	,			
2					Ļ								
3					В	aseli	_						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
61	57	Reilly	57	х					490	In line 433 of the Entity WG P&P is an additional sponsor responsibility: "The Sponsor shall affirm the election of the chair and vice chair."	add: appointing Working Group Chairs and other officers as defined in the Working Group P&P confirming the election of elected Working Group chairs, or else directing that another election be run or making a temporary appointment to the office.	Reject	9/1/2015
62	58	Reilly	58					х	433	This establishes a requirement and immediately says it is not a requirement. The sponsor shall affirm the election, but if the sponsor does not affirm the WG chair, then Requirements for the Sponsor belong in the Sponsor P&P, not in the WG P&P.	change to: The election of the Chair and Vice Chair shall be reported to the Sponsor for confirmation.	Change the first sentence to "The election of the Chair and Vice-Chair requires confirmation from the Sponsor." and change "affirm" to "confirm" in the second sentence.	9/1/2015
63	59	Reilly	59					х	552	3.4.3. e: WG should be responsible for WG documentation, not Sponsor documentation	e) Being responsible for the management and distribution of Working Group documentation	Accept	9/1/2015
64	60	Reilly	60					х	1010	Procedures are not worded hypothetically. Use 'may,' not 'might.'	Change to: The Sponsor may delegate development of a PAR	Accept	9/1/2015
65	61	Yve						Х		Delete "preferably"; file should identify Sponsor, Committee, or Working Group (check that sentence has correct group, i.e., after "identifying the" you should have either Sponsor, Committee, or Working Group depending on the P&P		Accept	9/1/2015
66	62	Yve	2	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	230	Add suggested timeline to have responses to AudCom comments and revised P&Ps uploaded to allow AudCom's review of responses and followup prior to the AudCom meeting.		Add a reference to the AudCom conventions	9/1/2015

	Α	В	С			F				J	К	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	eline	s co	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2						<u> </u>							
3					В	aseli	_						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
67	63	Yve	3	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	344	Insert "(IEEE-SA)" after "IEEE Standards Association"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
68	64	Yve	4					Х	346, 354, 701	Change "IEEE Standards Association" to "IEEE-SA"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
69	65	Yve	5	Х	Х	Х			349	Shade "this" before "Sponsor" or "Committee" for SCCs		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
70	66	Yve	6				Х		401	Change "IEEE Standards Association" to "IEEE-SA"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
71	67	Yve	7	X		Х			407	Item c) can be interpreted in two ways: Maintaining the standards as outlined in the Ops Man; or Maintaining the standards, which were developed in accordance with the Ops Man. Since the Ops Man does not provide procedures for maintenance, but instead points to the Sponsor P&Ps (see 5.1.1 of Ops Man), we need to allow for the addition of maintenance procedures in these P&Ps, and we need to make sure the language is clear about what is meant.		Delete "in accordance with the IEEE-SASB OpMan"	9/1/2015
72	68	Yve	8				Х		438	Put brackets around the "s" in "positions" since if the Vice and Treasurer are deleted, only the Secretary would be left		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
73	69	Yve	9				Х			Shade the italic text		Reject (italics was removed by another comment)	9/1/2015
74	70	Yve	10				Х		522	Change "SASB Bylaws," to "IEEE- SA Standards Board Bylaws" (remove comma) and change to italics, capitalize "participation" and place period inside end quotes		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
75	71	Yve	11					Χ	528	Change "Vice Chair" to "Vice-Chair"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
76	72	Yve	12				Х		538	Make "Policies and Procedures" lowercase		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015

	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	ı	J	К	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base	eline	s coi	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2													
3					В	aseli	ine						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change		Date
77	73	Yve	13				Χ			Make "Study Groups" lowercase		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
78	74	Yve	14				Χ			Change "adhere" to "adhering"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
79	75	Yve	15				Х		549	Change "group" to "Working Group"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
80	76	Yve	16						550	Capitalize "sponsor"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
81	77	Yve	17							Capitalize "sponsor"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
82	78	Yve	18	Х			X		557	Insert "the" before IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws, italicize "IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws" and remove comma afterward		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
83	79	Yve	19	Χ					558	Capitalize "participation"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
84	80	Yve	20			Χ				Place period inside end quote		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
85	81	Yve	21			X	Х	Х		Italicize "IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
86	82	Yve	22	Х		Х	Х	Х	589	Italicize "IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual" and "IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws"		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
87	83	Yve	23	Х		Х	Х	Х	590	Add "and the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual" at end of parentheses on copyright, and italicize the "IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual" that was inserted		Accept	9/1/2015
88	84	Yve	24				Х	Х	603	Please make sure that all instances of "IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws" and "IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual" are italicized		For editorial Staff review	9/1/2015
89	85	Yve	25	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	630	Make changes to item c) as shown in attached file		James moved to reject. Annette seconded. Gary H moved to table it. Howard seconded. Motion passed without opposition	9/21/2015

	Α	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	ı	J	К	L	М
1	ĺ	AudCom I	D2 base						omments				
2													
3					В	asel	ine						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
90	86	Yve	26	X		Х	Х	х	65	Add "and the clause on "Annual financial report" in the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual" and italicize "IEEE-SA Standards Board Operation Manual"		Gary H. moved to change "Ensure that the Sponsor adheres to the IEEE Finance Operations Manual." to "Ensure that the Sponsor adheres to the IEEE Finance Operations Manual and clause Annual financial report in the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual." Ron seconded.Motion carried without opposition	9/21/2015
90	87	Yve	27	Χ		Χ	Х	Χ	66	Italicize "IEEE-SA Standards Board		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
91										Bylaws"			
92	88	Yve	28			Χ	Χ	_		Change "any" to "all"		Reject	9/21/2015
93	89	Yve	29			Х		Х		Change "Secretary, [Treasurer]" to "Secretary[, Treasurer]"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
94	90	Yve	30	Х		Х	Х	Х	73	Change "publically" to "publicly" as this is the verbiage in the higher P&Ps		Accept	9/21/2015
95	91	Yve	31				Х		73	Change "committee" to "Working Group"		Accept	9/21/2015
96	92	Yve	32				Х		73	Change "Secretary [Treasurer]" to "Secretary[, Treasurer]"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
97	93	Yve	33				Х		74	Change "mMembership" to "membership"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
98	94	Yve	34	Х		Χ	Х		75) Make "Subclause" lowercase as in higher P&Ps		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
	95	Yve	35	Х		Х			76	Insert after "conflict with" the following phrase "these procedures," and add a comma before "or" on the next line		Change " to ensure that they are not in conflict with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual" to " to ensure that they are not in conflict with these procedures, the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual". Make the change in both 5.2 ad 5.3	9/21/2015
99 100	96	Yve	36				Х	Χ	78	Delete comma before "clause on"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015

	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	I	J	К	L	M
1	ĺ	AudCom	D2 base						omments				
2						1							
3					Ва	aseli	ne						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
101	97	Yve	37	Х		Х			791	Insert after "conflict with" the following phrase "these policies and procedures," and add a comma before "or" on the next line		See comment 95	9/21/2015
102	98	Yve	38			Х				Change "IEEE SASB" to "IEEE-SA Standards Board" and italicize "IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
103	99	Yve	39	Х		Х			804	Change "Duties of a Sponsor" to "Duties of the Sponsor"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
104		Yve	40				Х		806	Insert link to IEEE Code of Ethics		Accept	9/21/2015
105	101	Yve	41			Х				Insert closing quote at end of paragraph		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
106	102	Yve	42				Х		817	Change "IEEE-SA Standards Board (IEEE-SASB)" to "IEEE-SA Standards Board (SASB)" to be consistent with higher P&Ps		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
107	103	Yve	43	Х					814, 817	Change "IEEE SASB" to "IEEE-SA Standards Board (SASB)" and use "SASB" instead of "IEEE-SASB" to be consistent with higher P&Ps		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
107		Yve	44		1	Х			910	Change "IEEE-SASB" to "SASB"	+	For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
100		Yve	45		 	^	Χ	Х	922	Insert comma after "guidance"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
110		Yve	46		 			Х		Capitalize "working group"	 	For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
111	107	Yve	47			Х				Delete comma after "modified" (or insert comma before except throughout the document) and change "th" to "the"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
112	108	Yve	48	Χ		Х			838	Italicize "IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
113		Yve	49	Χ	1	Χ			841	Place period inside end quote		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
114	110	Yve	50			Х				Use corrected instruction language from Sponsor P&Ps for Clause 5.5		Withdrawn	9/21/2015
115	111	Yve	51	Χ					857	Place period inside end quote (2 times)		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
116		Yve	52	Χ	Ī				860	Change "requires" to "require"	1	For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015

	А	В	С		Е				Į	J	K	L	М
1		AudCom	D2 base	eline	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2													
3					В	aseli	_						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
117	113	Yve	53	Χ						Capitalize "chair"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
118	114	Yve	54				X		900	Insert a period after "(two-thirds)" and delete the remainder of the sentence. Create a second sentence "The "majority, two-thirds vote" is defined as one of the following:"		Change "Approval of an action requires approval by a majority (or two-thirds) vote as specified below in 7.1.1 (majority) and 7.1.2 (two-thirds) vote is defined as either:" to "Approval of an action requires approval by a majority (or two-thirds) vote as specified below in 7.1.1 (majority) and 7.1.2 (two-thirds). The "majority, two-thirds vote" is defined as one of the following:"	9/21/2015
119		Yve	55		1		Х		915	Insert colon after "vote"		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
120	116	Yve	56				Х	Х	931	Change "Approval to move the draft standards project " to "Approval to move the draft standard"		Accept	9/21/2015
121	117	Yve	57				Х		935	Capitalize "working group" and insert a period at end of paragrph (also check formatting of paragraph)		For editorial Staff review	9/21/2015
122	118	Yve	58	Х		Х	Х	Х	981-992	Edit clause as shown in attached file		Howard moved to revise clause 6.5 as discussed in Minutes_P&P changes-JPF0. Adrian seconded. Motion carried without opposition	9/21/2015
	119	Yve	59	Х	1	Χ	t		997, 1000	Capitalize "sponsor" or "committee"		For editorial Staff review	9/28/2015
123	3	<u> </u>								<u> </u>			
124		Yve	60			Χ				Place period inside end quote		For editorial Staff review	9/28/2015
125	121	Yve	61	X		Х	Х		998	Replace last sentence with the following: "If allowed, this clause shall not be modified except to include the rules that may be suspended and the conditions under which such suspension is allowed."		Accept for the five baselines	9/28/2015

	А	В	С	D	Е	F	G	Н	I	J	К	L	М
1		AudCom I	D2 base						omments				
2													
3					В	aseli	ne						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individual	WG-entity	Line no	Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
126	122	Yve	62	Х		Х			1037	At the end of the first sentence, include "or to include or delete the optional bracketed text"		Change "This clause shall not be modified, except for the addition of actions." to "This clause shall not be modified, except for a) moving actions to 7.1.2, b) adding actions, c) taking care of the brackets as described in the top instructions."	9/28/2015
127	123	Yve	63	Х					1047	Insert space between "co-sponsor" and "a"		For editorial Staff review	9/28/2015
128	124	Yve	64			Х				Change "Approval of a co-sponsor a project" to "Approval to co-sponsor a project"		Accept (apply also Sponsor baseline)	9/28/2015
129	125	Yve	65	Χ		Χ			1090	Place period inside end quote		For editorial Staff review	9/28/2015
130	126	Yve	66	Х		Х			1117	Should this be "This clause shall not be modified." ? The clause on meetings without quorum and confirmation by electronic ballot references this clause, so if it can be modified, the information from 7.4 may need to be included in 6.1		Reject	9/28/2015
	127	Yve	67	Χ		Х			1158	Insert "clause" after see and		For editorial Staff review (also	9/28/2015
131	128	Yve	68	Х					1208	capitalize "official" Insert "clause" after "Please see" and make "Publicity" lowercase		applies to SCC1) For editorial Staff review (also applies to Sponsor, SCC1 and SCC2)	9/28/2015
133	129	GH	1					Х	360	Introducing DR and DRA in Clause 2.3 without supporting text "designated representative" and "designated representative alternative". These terms are not explained until Clause 4.1	Put explination in 2.3	Change "Each DR or DRA member representative can make or second motions," to "Each Designated representatives (DR) or Designated Representative Alternate (DRA) can make or second motions,"	9/28/2015

	А	В	С				G		I		J	К	L	M
1		AudCom	D2 base	eline	s coi	mpila	ation	of c	omments					
2					<u> </u>	L.,								
3					В	aseli								
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no		Comment	Proposed change	AudCom disposition	Date
134	130	JP	1				х		6		AudCom's motion on D1 was "Change "Attendance credit is granted to those who attend at least 50% of" with "A participant shall be considered attending the meeting if those who attend at least 50% of". The language has been slightly changed.	Check the language	No change in D2	9/28/2015
135	131	JP	2				х		6	80	AudCom's motion on D1 was "Change "membership" with "voting privilege" in the two last paragragh of the clause". One occurrence of "membership privilege" was not changed with "voting privilege"	Check the language	Change "All membership privileges and rights" to "All voting privileges and rights"	9/28/2015
136	132	JP	3			х			7		AudCom's motion on D1 was "Change "Any attending individual" with "Participants". "Any attending individual" was changed with "Any attending participants"	Check the language	Change "Any attending participant " to "Any participant in attendance"	9/28/2015
137	133	JP	4	х					8		AudCom's motion on D1 was "Change "Any attending individual" with "Participants". "Any attending individual" was changed with "Any attending participants"	Check the language	Change "Any attending participant " to "Any participant in attendance"	9/28/2015
138	134	JP	5	х	х	х			658, 617 a	nd	AudCom moved on D1 to add definitions to 4.0 of the Individual and Entity WG baselines. Definitions were added to the Sponsor, SCC1 and SCC2 baselines too.	Review the changes in the Sponsor, SCC1 and SCC2 baselines	No change D2	9/28/2015
139	135	JP	6	х	х	х		х	6		A good improvement of 4.2 was made in the Individual WG baseline with changing "at least annually " with "annually for the previous year". The same improvement can be made in the other baselines	Update the other baselines	Accept	9/28/2015

	Α	В	С				G			J	K	L	М
1		AudCom [D2 base	lines	s cor	mpila	ation	of c	omments				
2						L							
3					Ва	aseli	_						
4	Comment Number	Person	Person's comment	Sponsor	SCC1	SCC2	WG-individua	WG-entity	Line no	Comment		AudCom disposition	Date
140		JP	7					х		Clause 10.0 was deleted in the Individual WG baseline. The clause remains in the Entity WG baseline as 11.0.	Remove 11.0 from the Entity WG baseline	Accept	9/28/2015
141	137	JP	8	Х	х	х				Tiltes of 4.1 are difffernt in the Sponsor, SCC1 and SCC2 baselines	Harmonize the titles	Change the titles in SCC1 and SCC2 to be "4.1 Voting membership Requirements"	9/28/2015
142	138	JP	9	X	х	х			697, 668 and	Tiltes of 4.2 are difffernt in the Sponsor, SCC1 and SCC2 baselines	Harmonize the titles	Change "4.2 Review of Membership" to "4.2 Review of voting membership" and "The Chair shall review the membership list annually." to "The Chair shall review the voting membership list annually." in SCC1 and SCC2	9/28/2015
143	139	JP	10	х	х	х			•	The last sentence of 5.5 of the Sponsor baseline "The Sponsor or Sponsor chair (as applicable) may remove an officer of any subgroup." is not in SCC1 5.2 and SCC2 5.5.	Harmonize	Change "The Sponsor or Sponsor chair (as applicable) may remove an officer of any subgroup." to "The Sponsor chair may remove an officer of any subgroup." in the Sponsor P&P and add the sentence to SCC1 and SCC2	9/28/2015
144	140	JP	11	х	х	х				6.0 meetings: The 15 days notice for electronic meetings included in the Sponsor baseline is not included in the SCC1 and SCC2 baselines	Update 6.0 of the SCC1 and the SCC2 baselines	Update 6.0 of the SCC1 and the SCC2 baselines to match the sponsor baseline	9/28/2015
145	141	JP	12	X	х	х				7.3 Proxy voting: the language improvements made in the SCC1 baseline are not made in the Sponsor and SCC2 baselines.	Update 7.3 of the Sponsor and the SCC2 baselines	In the Sponsor and SCC2 baselines, remove "The Chair shall be informed of all proxies prior to the start of the meeting in which the proxy is to be in effect." and add "Members serving as proxies shall inform the Chair of their proxy prior to the start of the meeting in which the proxy is to be in effect." at the end of the second paragraph	9/28/2015

Sponsor Baseline, SCC1 (also use for SCC2, Indiv WG, and Entity WG)

6.5 Minutes

This clause shall not be modified.

The minutes shall record the essentials in concise format, including the following:

- a) Name of group
- b) Date and location of meeting
- c) Officer presiding, including the name of the secretary who wrote the minutes
- d) Attendance Meeting Participants, including affiliation
- e) Call to order, Chair's remarks
- f) Approval of minutes of previous meeting
- g) Approval of agenda
- h) Technical topics
 - 1) Brief summary of discussions and conclusions
 - 1)
 - 2) Motions <u>exactly as they are stated</u>, including the names of mover and seconder, and the outcome of each motion
 - The fact of a rRoll call vote, but not the vote of specific participantss.
 - References in the brief summary to policies and procedures used in the decision-making is good practice
 - References in the brief summary to due diligence performed in connection with consideration of relevant issues, including consultation with advisors, is good practice
 - 2)
- Reminders of policies and procedures, or compliance with policies and procedures or good practice
- Steps taken to obtain information or guidance during consideration of relevant issues prior to a decision, including participation of advisors
- i) Action items
- i)j) Items reported out of executive session
- k) Recesses and time of final adjournment
- i) Next meeting--date and location

Copies of handouts and subcommittee reports may be included in the minutes or<u>should be</u> made available as separate items.

All submissions, presentations, and reports considered during the meeting by the Committee/WG shall be referenced in the minutes. Urls should be provided where possible.

The following shall not be recorded in minutes:

- Transcriptions of detailed discussions
- Attributions of comments or resolutions to specific participants
- Inaccurate or non-factual information

Privileged or executive session discussions, other than what is agreed to be reported out

The minutes should be reviewed with the Chair prior to distribution or posting, and distribution shall be in PDF format or a non-editable format. Until approved, the minutes shall be denoted as a draft. Once approved, only the final approved minutes shall be retained. A list of action items can be maintained as a separate document.

- Comments received on Draft D2 of 2015 Baseline Updates AudCom D2 baselines comments resolutions R1.xlsx AudCom D2 changes_yeh.docx
- Additional comments from James Gilb Membership-roster-v00.ppt
 Suspension-of-the-rules-v00.ppt
- Comments on Draft D1 deferred to the September meeting AudCom D1 comments-deferred to Sept.xlsx
- Comment on the Baseline Instructions (Document from Gary Hoffman)
 BaselineP&PClauseDirections.pdf
- Inputs from the Ad Hoc on Referencing unaudited Sponsor documents (e.g. Sponsor Operating Manuals, etc.) in P&Ps (Adrian Stephens)
- Recommendation to the Standards Board

Completed on Sept 21

- Comments received on Draft D2 of 2015 Baseline Updates
 - Progress was made. The agreed dispositions are available in: AudCom D2 baselines comments resolutions R2.xlsx
 Minutes_P&P changes-JPF0

Completed on Sept 28

- Comments received on Draft D2 of 2015 Baseline Updates
 - AudCom completed the review.
 - Motion passed: To accept the dispositions discussed today (28 Sept) excluding those deferred to Staff (see AudCom D2 baselines comments resolutions R3.xlsx)
 - Motion passed: The result of the editing for the editorial review comments be made available for informal email review followed by a 10 days electronic ballot to approve the edits.
- Additional comments from James Gilb
 - Motion passed: moved to replace 6.6 Suspension of Rules in all baselines with "6.6 Suspension of Rules

This clause shall not be modified.

None of the rules or requirements in these policies and procedures may be suspended."

■ The roster issue was discussed. The discussion was tabled. Discussion will continue at next meeting.

Completed on Sept 28 (continued)

- Report from the AudCom ad-hoc on "Referencing"
 - Adrian presented the report. Discussion will continue at next meeting.

Completed on Oct 5

- Additional comments from James Gilb (Membership-roster-v01.ppt)
 - Motions passed to approve the following changes:
 - In 3.4.3, d) change "participant roster and submitting" to be "membership roster, referred to in 4.3, and submitting"
 - Revise 4.3 Membership Roster to read:

This clause may be modified with the exception of distribution of the roster.

The Secretary shall make reasonable efforts to maintain a current Sponsor roster. Due to privacy concerns, the roster shall not be distributed except to the IEEE-SA Board of Governors, IEEE-SA Standards Board, and IEEE-SA staff unless everybody on the roster has submitted their written approval for such distribution. The roster shall include the following:

- a) Title of the Sponsor and its designation.
- b) Scope of the Sponsor.
- c) Officers: Chair, Vice Chair, Secretary, Treasurer.
- d) Members: for all, name, e-mail address, affiliation and membership status (e.g., voting member, member, etc.).
- e) [For each subgroup other than Working Groups: subgroup title, Chair, and names, e-mail addresses, and affiliations of all members.]



Completed on Oct 5 (continued)

- Inputs from the Ad Hoc on Referencing unaudited Sponsor documents in P&Ps (Adrian Stephens)
 - No consensus was reached. The discussion is deferred to next year baselines.
- Comment on the Baseline Instructions
 - Motion passed: To separate the instructional text (5-6 pages) in beginning of the baselines in five instructional documents owned and to be approved by AudCom for the five baselines, add it as a link in the baselines, and make it available on the AudCom web site.
- Comments on Draft D1 deferred to the September meeting
 - The comments were found overcame by events.
- PAR Study Group (new comment from Yve)
 - After discussion no change was made.
- Clarifications of a few previously approved dispositions
 - Done

Completed on Oct 5 (continued)

- Schedule
 - The result of the editing for the editorial review comments is expected to be available for informal email review by middle of next week
 - The 10 days letter ballot for approving to move the baselines to SASB is expected to open on Oct 21